A DATA DRIVEN APPROACH TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER ENGAGEMENT

Unlocking a 15%+ growth opportunity
About Boston Consulting Group

Boston Consulting Group partners with leaders in business and society to tackle their most important challenges and capture their greatest opportunities. BCG was the pioneer in business strategy when it was founded in 1963. Today, we help clients with total transformation—inspiring complex change, enabling organizations to grow, building competitive advantage and driving bottom-line impact.

To succeed, organizations must blend digital and human capabilities. Our diverse, global teams bring deep industry and functional expertise and a range of perspectives to spark change. BCG delivers solutions through leading-edge management consulting along with technology and design, corporate and digital ventures—and business purpose. We work in a uniquely collaborative model across the firm and throughout all levels of the client organization, generating results that allow our clients to thrive.

About Capillary

Capillary Technologies partners with leading retailers, brands and consumer facing companies by providing technology driven solutions for loyalty management, CRM and omnichannel customer engagement through a cloud based B2B SaaS (Software as a Service) platform powered by AI. Founded in 2008, Capillary Technologies has been featured by Harvard Business Review as a pioneer in ‘reverse innovation’.

Capillary works with over 400 merchants, including Fortune 500 enterprises to solve their key challenges around capturing consumer data to drive better engagement and advocacy. Capillary’s platform powers 100+ loyalty programs and supports 500+ million customers and over 120,000 stores across 30 countries. Capillary has local teams based out of South East Asia, China, USA, the Middle East and India. Capillary’s strategic investors include Warburg Pincus, Sequoia Capital, American Express Ventures, Avatar Capital and Qualcomm Ventures.
About the report

A pressing question for marketing and digital leaders today is how to ensure a rewarding customer experience across multiple touch points by effectively utilizing data. While capturing customer data is only a part of the solution, organizations need to improve their maturity on Data Led Customer Engagement (DLCE) to build strategic data use cases that demonstrate value to customers. In doing so, they must overcome notable challenges, and there is no single guidance or universally accepted approach to help them.

This report aims to address this key unmet need with the introduction of the Stop Hold Purchase (SHoP) framework. SHoP enables assessment of DLCE maturity of organizations across seven key dimensions. Cross sectoral SHoP benchmarks were compiled from an extensive survey of over 100 companies across 5 industries and 13 countries. The results highlighted the key opportunities and gaps across the different customer engagement dimensions which can help unlock 15%+ topline impact.

This report employs these observations to help synthesize top priorities for marketing and digital leaders to advance DLCE maturity, with special focus on creating a roadmap to achieve the optimal end state in the relatively unevolved Loyalty dimension. Also, the introduction of a scientific methodology for determining Loyalty Delivered Sales (LDS) enables assessment of the true business impact delivered by a loyalty program. These findings, if holistically embedded, will help organizations steer their customer engagement strategy in the right direction, setting themselves apart going forward.
CONTENTS

1 Introduction
   Key customer engagement challenges marketers face

2 Our Approach
   SHoP framework for Data Led Customer Engagement

3 Key Findings
   Identifying gaps and opportunities through a global survey

4 Deep Dive - Loyalty Programs
   A toolkit to build loyal customers that spend more

5 Summary
   Synopsis of key observations
Businesses face multiple challenges in keeping modern consumers engaged

**Lack of 'newness'**
Brands may lose relevance to customers over time, as fresh emerging brands compete and match evolving customer interests

**Decision fatigue**
Customers fatigued by growth of options, causing inability to find appropriate products and making shopping painful and time-consuming

**Easily distracted**
Customers shop once, but lose interest or brand fades from memory and are no longer top of mind

**Managing the spam**
Customers unsubscribe from emails due to frequent spam from irrelevant emails, with brands no longer top of mind

Customers wouldn't notice if 3/4 of brands globally ceased to exist

~70% of customers would switch to a competitor with an easier process to find and select the desired product

8 seconds is the average attention span of a modern customer

43% customers unsubscribe from a marketing mailing list when they find information irrelevant

Source: BCG Analysis
These challenges manifest across all touchpoints of the consumer journey:

- **In-store**:
  - Lack of personalized treatment for repeat customers

- **Digital**:
  - Irrelevant ads/recommendations flooding user feed
  - Repeated irrelevant ads not accounting for previous customer action
  - Product information unavailable or not easily accessible on online platform
  - In-store personnel lacks expertise/consumer info to answer queries
  - Lack of seamless payment mechanism, corrupting user experience
  - Not all channels monitored; complaint resolution not in time

- **Physical**:
  - Product information unavailable or not easily accessible on online platform

- **Digital out of store**:
  - Non-personalized and generic product and offer recommendation

Customer pain points:

- Irrelevant ads/recommendations flooding user feed (A)
- Repeated irrelevant ads not accounting for previous customer action (B)
- Non-personalized and generic product and offer recommendation (C)
- Product information unavailable or not easily accessible on online platform (D)
- In-store personnel lacks expertise/consumer info to answer queries (E)
- Lack of seamless payment mechanism, corrupting user experience (F)
- Not all channels monitored; complaint resolution not in time (G)

Customer actions:

1. Customer sees ad (email, social media, search engine)
2. Customer retargeted based on previous click throughs
3. Customer checks store and checks for product availability
4. Customer visits store and checks for product availability
5. Customer discusses product with in-store personnel
6. Customer completes payment process
7. Customer raises service request post purchase

Customer insights:

- **A** 52% likely to switch brands if communications not personalized
- **B** >50% feel comparing prices and similar products important before purchasing a product
- **C** 76% prefer a salesperson focused on understanding their needs instead of making a quick sale
- **D** 74% likely to switch to another brand if an easy checkout process is not available
- **E** 64% expect companies to respond in real-time
- **F** 48% expect specialized treatment for being a repeat customer

Source: BCG Analysis

... making it necessary to capture and leverage consumer data throughout their journey.
Data is the answer for positive journeys, but customers have low trust and willingness to share data

Only 29% of consumers agree that handing over their data resulted in better products or services.

64% of customers blame companies over anyone else, including a hacker, if a company loses personal information/data.

75% of customers now limit the amount of personal information they share online.


Companies need to build strategic data use-cases to demonstrate value to customers

Continue to inspire with personalized content
Employ a robust data-driven approach to serve personalized content and show comprehensive understanding of customers.

Help them navigate towards most relevant content
Help customers quickly find what they are looking for, adapt to their behavior, and facilitate seamless purchase pathways.

Craft on-boarding journeys for loyalty
Design customer onboarding journeys to both understand the most about the customer, and incentivize repeat transactions.

Minimize the spam
Ensure personalized frequency or ability to select less frequent communication instead of simple unsubscribe option.
This whitepaper focuses on creating a go-to toolkit for leaders to drive Data Led Customer Engagement.

1. SHoP framework to measure and drive DLCE maturity
   - For solving the most pressing questions of CMOs, the Stop Hold Purchase (SHoP) framework was conceptualized for assessing maturity of organizations in Data Led Customer Engagement (DLCE).
   - We observed that companies span across 4 tiers based on DLCE maturity.

2. Comprehensive benchmarking of 100+ companies on SHoP
   - Extensive survey of 100+ firms across 5 industries spanning 13 countries.
   - DLCE diagnostic performed across 7 SHoP dimensions and 40+ activators.
   - Robust cross-sectoral benchmarks established to understand key opportunities and gaps across dimensions.

3. Synthesizing top priorities for CMOs to advance maturity
   - Key differentiators laid out between leaders and laggards on SHoP dimensions.
   - In-depth analysis of success factors and enablers critical for building capabilities with Part 1 Deep Dive covering details of the Engagement and Loyalty dimension.
Stop, Hold, Purchase (SHoP) framework: 7 key dimensions and 40+ activators of Data led Customer Engagement

Excellence in Data Led Customer Engagement

1. Data-driven Marketing (Stop)
   - Holistic data
   - Audience definition
   - Targeting techniques

2. Engagement and Loyalty (Hold)
   - Simple
   - Functionalities
   - Differentiated engagement
   - Experiential

3. Commerce (Purchase)
   - Multi-channel selling
   - Frictionless purchase process

4. Personalization and Analytics
   - Use cases
   - Capabilities
   - Test / iterate

5. Data and BI
   - Multi-source data feeds
   - MIS report

6. Tech stack
   - Open Architecture
   - Automation tools

7. Ways of working
   - Org structure
   - Cross-functional
   - Agile and flexible

Business model
- Insource vs outsource
- Data ownership
- Leveraging assets
- Strategic partnerships

Customer facing Capabilities
- Level of automation
- Event capture/trigger
- Self-service analytics

Enablers
- Event based trigger
- Use cases
- Training and certification

Refer to Appendix for more details about individual dimensions and corresponding activators
Companies span across four tiers based on their SHoP maturity

**Pioneer**
Holistic view of customers from real-time data integration; Dynamic hyper-personalization using AI/ML models; Highly flexible and feature-rich loyalty program rewarding behavioral events and social interactions; Seamless omnichannel journey with one-click checkout

**Progressive**
Data feeds from multiple sources integrated daily and employed for content development/delivery; Targeting of smaller customer segments using statistical models; Multi-tier and gamified coalition partner-led loyalty program; Frictionless movement across channels

**Emerging**
Multiple internal and external fragmented data sources leveraged for marketing and rule-based targeting of large and static customer segments; Brand-owned tiered multi-channel loyalty program with partnerships for redemption flexibility; Partially-integrated sales channels

**Nascent**
Limited leveraging of customer data for engagement using a one-size-fits-all approach that drives static communication content with no personalization; Rudimentary brand-owned single-tier loyalty program; Standalone sales channel
25-30% incremental topline potential for companies by advancing DLCE maturity

~15% avg. increase in topline by advancing 2 maturity levels

Topline Impact

- Nascent: 2-7%
- Emerging: 8-14%
- Progressive: 15-20%
- Pioneer: 21-30%

Key Operating Metrics

- 10-12% increase in customer conversion across the curve
- 2-2.5x growth in customers with increased basket size
- 2x increase in engagement; 300 bp increase in Net Promoter Score (NPS)

1. Impact driven by elements of SHoP framework such as DDM, Loyalty, Commerce, Personalization etc.  
Source: BCG-Google Data driven Marketing Assessment, 2017; Google-BCG Personalization in Retail Consumer Survey, December 2018, Rep Phase; total N=1025; Based on Apparel client benchmarking by Capillary Technologies; BCG analysis
Starting Point: 100+ companies across 5 industries participated in the global SHoP maturity assessment survey

**Industry**
- Retail: 40%
- CPG: 18%
- BFSI: 17%
- T&L: 11%
- Telco: 14%

**Region**
- North America: 26%
- Rest of APAC: 19%
- SEA: 55%

**Firm Size** (in USD)
- $100 Mn - $1 Bn: 27%
- $1 Bn - $5 Bn: 27%
- > $5 Bn: 46%

**Job Role**
- CMO: 42%
- CDO: 23%
- CMO-1: 25%
- CDO-1: 10%

**Decision Making Areas**
- Data-driven Marketing: 76%
- CRM and Loyalty: 87%
- Commerce: 51%

1. CPG - Consumer Packaged Goods, BFSI - Banking, Financial Services and Insurance, T&L - Travel and Leisure, Telco - Telecommunications
2. Responses collected from: SEA - Singapore, Malaysia, Indonesia, Philippines, Vietnam and Thailand; Rest of APAC - India, Greater China, Japan, Australia and New Zealand; NAMR - United States and Canada
3. Responses collected primarily from firms with annual turnover from regional operations > $100 Mn USD.

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113
~75% of companies acknowledged that data is the most important lever to drive growth and efficiency...

Drive Growth
via data driven marketing, sales program, building new products

Drive efficiency
via store operations optimization, supply chain management etc.

Firms recognize the potential of DLCE to advance their business agenda

... and self-acknowledged 5-6% additional topline potential with better DLCE maturity

What level of annual incremental revenue has your company achieved from DLCE?

What level of annual incremental revenue can be achieved in your company from DLCE running at full potential?

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113; BCG Analysis
~95% of companies have started their DLCE maturity journey. However, >50% companies stuck in Emerging maturity tier with only 2% reaching the Pioneer tier.

1. Maturity tier assignment by assessing DLCE capabilities across 7 dimensions of SHoP framework
Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113
Among industries, Telco reveals higher maturity with ~70% companies Progressive and above; Retail & CPG have a wide spectrum which varies based on firm size.

Note: Ends of blue ribbon denote the lowest and highest maturity score for the dimension
Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113; BCG Analysis

1. All Nascent companies are relatively smaller with annual turnover < $1 Bn
2. All Pioneer companies are relatively large with annual turnover > $5 Bn
3. Retail and CPG exhibit higher variance in maturity vis-à-vis company size vs other industries
4. Lowest levels of DLCE maturity seen in CPG firms since traditionally they don't have direct access to customer data
5. Telco & BFSI more evolved owing to business requirements e.g., know your customer (KYC) - enabling better data capture
Significant variation in maturity level of companies evidenced across SHoP dimensions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% companies across each maturity level</th>
<th>Nascent</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
<th>Progressive</th>
<th>Pioneer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Data-driven marketing</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engagement and Loyalty</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commerce</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personalization and Analytics</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data and BI</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tech stack</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ways of working</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113

Important to understand what differentiates companies with leading maturities
Most firms establish **good data collection & feedback mechanisms**, but leaders truly unlock **data-led opportunities** (e.g., personalization).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maturity range on activators</th>
<th>DDM laggards¹</th>
<th>DDM leaders¹</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Holistic data</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capturing 1st, 2nd and 3rd party data for creating comprehensive customer view</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audience definition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophisticated techniques for defining customer segments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Targeting techniques</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Channel selection and media purchase strategy for precise targeting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content dev. and delivery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personalized message tailoring and delivery mechanism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Testing and feedback mech.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media effectiveness and testing for optimizing marketing activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

94% companies enrich in-house customer data using external data and >80% use channel effectiveness reports as a feedback mechanism regularly in media buying decisions.

But only...

25% companies buy media programmatically across all channels while ~20% companies personalize both channel and timing of communication.

"**Decisions for where the dollars go are not analytically driven**"

- CMO, mid-sized Retail firm, NAMR

---

1. Laggards and leaders - Responses with dimension score falling below 10th and 90th percentile respectively.

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113; BCG Analysis
**Loyalty is a stage wise journey** for the companies - what differentiates the leading programs are elements that build aspiration for customers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maturity range on activators</th>
<th>Difference in maturity scores</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Loyalty laggards</strong>¹</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Loyalty leaders</strong>¹</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Simple**
  - Seamless onboarding process for loyalty program

- **Functionalities**
  - Platform feature depth with dynamic reward accretion

- **Flexible**
  - Flexibility in earn/burn across partner member network

- **Differentiated engagement**
  - Customer tierization with personalized rewards

- **Experiential**
  - Integration of gamification elements into loyalty strategy

~95% of companies use a multi-channel onboarding approach

with 60% employing a process which can enroll customers within 5 mins

But only…

10% adopt gamification as a core element of their loyalty programs

and only ~12% dynamically segment customers & map relevant offers

“We would like to gamify our apps to keep our members engaged and entertained by our services."

- CMO, mid-sized T&L player, India

---

1. Laggards and leaders - Responses with dimension score falling below 10th and 90th percentile respectively

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n= 101 (companies with a loyalty program); BCG Analysis
Adopting **social commerce** with a **frictionless transaction process** is a key characteristic of leading maturity in Commerce

### Difference in maturity scores

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maturity range on activators</th>
<th>Commerce laggards¹</th>
<th>Commerce leaders¹</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multi-channel selling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence and degree of integration across multiple sales channels</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frictionless purchase process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seamless customer payment journey</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functionalities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feature richness and depth of commerce platform across channels</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer feedback</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service channels, response time and feedback incorporation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

64% of companies’ sales come from conventional channels such as physical store, mobile/web apps, marketplaces

70% collect feedback from customers from more than 1 channel

But only…

<12% sales generated from social commerce channels

<20% of companies operate a process where transactions are completed in <3 steps

"Consumers expect an easy transaction procedure - we are working hard to move towards a single-click process"

- CMO, mid-sized Telco player, SEA

---

¹. Laggards and leaders - Responses with dimension score falling below 10th and 90th percentile respectively

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113; BCG Analysis
While basic personalization is employed across use-cases by most companies, leaders automate personalization with AI/ML e.g., dynamic micro-segmentation.

>80% companies send out personalized communication with product/offers recommendations

But only...

14% able to achieve micro-segmentation of customers with ~20% using real time data

while only 37% employ deep learning and AI-based models in the backend

"We face problems in need-based customer segregation and creating personalized messages that stimulate action."

- CDO-1, large T&L player, GRC

1. Laggards and leaders - Responses with dimension score falling below 10th and 90th percentile respectively

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113; BCG Analysis
While most firms tap into multiple data sources, leaders enable high-frequency integration and analysis which drives key business decisions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maturity range on sub-dimensions</th>
<th>Data and BI laggards¹</th>
<th>Data and BI leaders¹</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multi source data feed</td>
<td><img src="image1" alt="Laggar" /></td>
<td><img src="image2" alt="Leader" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal and external data used for gathering customer insights</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIS report</td>
<td><img src="image3" alt="Laggar" /></td>
<td><img src="image4" alt="Leader" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIS functionalities and frequency of usage in key business decisions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data lake/warehouse</td>
<td><img src="image5" alt="Laggar" /></td>
<td><img src="image6" alt="Leader" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Storage architecture for different data formats</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>360° view</td>
<td><img src="image7" alt="Laggar" /></td>
<td><img src="image8" alt="Leader" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Availability and ease of use of holistic customer data view</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event capture/trigger</td>
<td><img src="image9" alt="Laggar" /></td>
<td><img src="image10" alt="Leader" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration frequency of multiple data feeds</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self servicing analytics</td>
<td><img src="image11" alt="Laggar" /></td>
<td><img src="image12" alt="Leader" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational delivery mechanism of data analysis results and reports</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

88% of companies use at least 2 data feeds each from internal and external sources with ~50% collecting both structured and unstructured data.

But only...

20% of firms carry out data integration on a daily basis and just 40% have integrated analytics teams across functions.

"We have a lot of data points fragmented across tables, but no clear customer data strategy or a Data Science team in place."

- CDO, small Retail player, SEA

1. Laggards and leaders - Responses with dimension score falling below 10th and 90th percentile respectively.
Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113; BCG Analysis
Deep Dive - Loyalty
Across industries, Loyalty is relatively the least evolved dimension

This whitepaper further examines Loyalty in depth

Loyalty is a key opportunity for CMOs to unlock given low maturity today vis-à-vis other dimensions

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n=113; BCG Analysis
3 pressing questions before CMOs to unlock loyalty opportunity

What does a successful loyalty program look like?

What is the roadmap to setup/level-up loyalty at my company?

How to measure the financial impact it delivers?
What does a successful loyalty program look like?

Successful loyalty programs pull levers across five dimensions …

1. **Simple**
   - Frictionless onboarding of members

2. **Functionalities**
   - Depth of platform features enhancing customer experience

3. **Flexibility**
   - Wide array of options for point accretion and redemption

4. **Differentiated Engagement**
   - Offerings tailored based on customer profile

5. **Experiential**
   - Trigger desired customer behavior via gamified elements

**Seamless enrolment**
- Multichannel onboarding with minimal registration time

**Feature richness**
- Rich feature depth with user events-based rewards

**Partner ecosystem**
- Multiple avenues for redemption of rewards

**Customer tiers**
- Multi-tiered program with different rewards for each tier

**Gamification strategy**
- Adoption of gamification as core part of loyalty strategy

**Instant account activation**
- Instant access to all features post enrolment

**Reward expiry terms**
- Existence of expiry timeline for collected rewards

**Redemption flexibility**
- Flexibility in redemption: part-cash and part-points payment, point top-up etc.

**Personalized rewards**
- Reward offerings personalized to members

**Gamification elements**
- Multiple levers for gamification - transactions, referrals, games etc.
…to drive customer delight and tangible impact

- **Simple Functionalities**
  - 70% increase in enrollment rate by deploying mobile app alongside web & offline channels

- **Differentiated Engagement**
  - 57% of companies reward members based on non-transactional interactions (e.g., personal event, login) in addition to transactional events (e.g., purchase)
  - 59% of members prefer a coalition/multi-partner program model with flexibility of earn and burn across partner members

- **Flexibility**
  - 70% of loyalty program customers find special treatment important (e.g., birthday discounts etc.)

- **Experiential**
  - 80% of consumers get excited by finding new ways to earn points
  - 69% of loyalty program customers find special treatment important (e.g., birthday discounts etc.)
  - 30% increase in enrollment rate by deploying mobile app alongside web & offline channels
  - 75% increase in member spending with tailored offers
  - 70% increase in customer engagement levels when gamification is built into loyalty program

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n= 101 (companies with a loyalty program); BCG Analysis
Key factors influencing loyalty-driven revenue vary across industries - CMOs need to adopt a tailored approach while creating loyalty program roadmaps.

### Top drivers of member revenue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>Rank 1</th>
<th>Rank 2</th>
<th>Rank 3</th>
<th>Rank 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Retail</td>
<td>Customer tiers</td>
<td>Reward expiry terms</td>
<td>Feature richness</td>
<td>Gamification strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPG</td>
<td>Point redemption modes</td>
<td>Reward expiry terms</td>
<td>Customer tiers</td>
<td>Feature richness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T&amp;L</td>
<td>Partner ecosystem</td>
<td>Personalized rewards</td>
<td>Reward expiry terms</td>
<td>Feature richness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BFSI</td>
<td>Partner ecosystem</td>
<td>Feature richness</td>
<td>Redemption flexibility</td>
<td>Customer tiers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telco</td>
<td>Customer tiers</td>
<td>Gamification elements</td>
<td>Feature richness</td>
<td>Instant account activation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SHoP DLCE Maturity Assessment Survey 2021; n= 101 (companies with a loyalty program); BCG Analysis
What is the roadmap to setup a loyalty program?
Advancing loyalty maturity is a stage-wise journey requiring intervention at each step

### Loyalty maturity journey

**Loyalty lever**
- Simple
- Functionalities
- Flexible
- Differentiated Engagement
- Experiential
- Operating KPIs to track
- Financial KPIs to track

#### Loyalty lever

**Nascent**
- Introduce loyalty to consumers

**Emerging**
- Drive rapid enrolment and kickstart redemption

**Progressive**
- Weave rewarding customer journey with a personalized and flexible program

**Pioneer**
- Unlock true customer aspiration and brand advocacy to drive divergence

**Member acquisition rate**
- **Reward redemption ratio**
- **Repurchase ratio**
- **Divergence ratio**
- **Net Promoter Score**

---

1. **Divergence ratio** - Factor by which sales multiply for a group of redeemers when compared to a similar non-redeemer set observed over a time period

---

Need for an objective approach to **quantify financial impact of a loyalty program** across maturity stages
How to determine the financial impact delivered by a loyalty program?

Introducing a unique LDS approach

Scientific method to measure true Loyalty Delivered Sales (LDS)

Study based LDS benchmarks for 7 different elements of loyalty programs
A multivariate statistical method baselines customer behavior

Two statistically similar groups of **redeemers and lookalike non-redeemers** (customers who are yet to make their first redemption) were identified from loyalty programs based on similarity of behavioral and purchase patterns.

This was achieved by using **k-nearest neighbor** supervised ML algorithm.

**Loyalty Delivered Sales (LDS)** is the difference in sales between the two groups. When measured as a % of total sales (LDS%), it quantifies the financial impact of loyalty program.

**Parameters for comparison**
- **Total average visit**
- **Average spend per visit**
- **Average discount percent per customer**

In successful programs, redeemers spend 2X higher than lookalike non-redeeming members.
LDS benchmarks for different elements of program established through extensive studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements of Loyalty Programs</th>
<th>LDS% Benchmark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Base Loyalty</td>
<td>1-2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personalized Loyalty</td>
<td>0.5-3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tier Loyalty</td>
<td>0.5-1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Loyalty</td>
<td>0.5-3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital Loyalty</td>
<td>1-4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynamic Loyalty</td>
<td>1-4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partner Loyalty</td>
<td>1-3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADOPTION LEVERS</th>
<th>INTRINSIC LEVERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Loyalty Conversion</td>
<td>Generosity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: LDS framework - Loyalty Driven Sales framework developed by Capillary Technologies; Capillary Analysis
2-20% topline potential for organizations by advancing loyalty maturity
Driven by customer behavioral and transactional divergence

Nascent
- Introduce loyalty to consumers

Emerging
- Drive rapid enrolment and kickstart redemption

Progressive
- Weave rewarding customer journey with a personalized and flexible program

Pioneer
- Unlock true customer aspiration and brand advocacy to drive divergence

Source: LDS framework - Loyalty Driven Sales framework developed by Capillary Technologies; Capillary Analysis
Loyalty is not just about rewarding customers, it’s a strategic imperative for any data-oriented company.

**The “Loyalty Business”**

- More members → More member value creation
- More program partners → More quality data
- Better, data-driven user-cases feeding member experience

**The Data Business**

- Richer Personas
- More partner value creation
- More program partners
- More members

**Additional data can act as fuel for creating new use-cases or go-to-market initiatives**

**Up-to-date personas basis consumer behavior can enable real-time intervention and personalization**

**Truly identify high potential customers that need to be nurtured**
5. SUMMARY

Significant top line potential for leaders in driving Data Led Customer Engagement (DLCE). Advancing maturity will typically lead to 15%+ topline impact for consumer facing companies.

Most companies have started their DLCE maturity journey. However, >50% companies stuck in Emerging maturity tier with only 2% Pioneers.

Telco is most advanced on DLCE maturity with ~70% companies Progressive and above. Retail and CPG showcase wide variation driven by the size of the company.

Out of the SHoP dimensions, Data-driven Marketing emerges as the most evolved dimension - loyalty relatively the least evolved for companies.

While 90% of firms have already adopted loyalty programs, majority still in early maturity stages with ~80% in either Nascent or Emerging.

Driving success in Loyalty requires a stage wise approach for companies - and each stage targets different levers and drives different KPIs for the business.

Done right, customer behavioral and transactional divergence driven by loyalty programs can result in a topline potential of up to 20%.
Boston Consulting Group publishes reports, articles and books on related topics that may be of interest to senior executives. Recent examples include those listed here.

The Next Level of Personalization in Retail
A report by Boston Consulting Group in association with Google, June 2019

Mastering Digital Marketing Maturity
A report by Boston Consulting Group in association with Google, Feb 2018

Capillary Technologies publishes guides, reports on the latest insights on customer loyalty and engagement. Recent examples include those listed here.

Customer loyalty 2020 and beyond
A whitepaper by Capillary Technologies, Jun 2020

Acing the CEM experiment
A handbook on 40 Customer Engagement Management (CEM) learnings from leading brands by Capillary Technologies, Dec 2018

FOR FURTHER READING

NOTE TO THE READERS

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Shiv Choudhury is a Managing Director and Partner in the Singapore office of the Boston Consulting Group. Vikash Jain is a Managing Director and Partner in the New Delhi office of the Boston Consulting Group. Shaleen Sinha is the Director, India Growth Tech, based out of the Mumbai office of the Boston Consulting Group. Aneesh Reddy is the Co-founder and Chief Executive Officer at Capillary Technologies.

FOR FURTHER DETAILS, CONTACT

Shiv Choudhury
Managing Director and Partner
BCG
choudhury.shiv@bcg.com

Vikash Jain
Managing Director and Partner
BCG
jain.vikash@bcg.com

Aneesh Reddy
Co-founder and CEO
Capillary Technologies
aneesh@capillarytech.com

Shaleen Sinha
Director - India Growth Tech
BCG
sinha.shaleen@bcg.com

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was undertaken by Boston Consulting Group (BCG) in collaboration with Capillary Technologies.

We would like to thank JungKiu Choi, MD and Partner, BCG Singapore; Sandeep Bhalla, Senior Advisor, BCG Singapore; and Santosh Reddy, VP Marketing and Sales, Capillary Technologies for their support and guidance while developing this report.

We would also like to thank Abhinav Duggal, Arnab Banerjee, Ujwal Kalra, Naveen Chakravarthy and Pranay Boobna for their assistance in writing this report.

We are thankful to Vanita Vasudevan, Gitanjali Mittal, Maha Dhurairaj, Micky Chittora and Yan Yu Chua for managing the marketing process as well as Saroj Singh and Abbasali Asamdi for their contribution to the editing, design and production of this report.

If you are interested in finding out your organization’s DLCE maturity, reach out to dlce@capillarytech.com
Appendix
SHoP dimensions and activators
Data-driven Marketing
Optimizing brand communication using insights on customer’s motivations, preferences and behavior

1. Holistic data - Capturing 1st, 2nd and 3rd party data for creating comprehensive customer view

2. Audience definition - Sophisticated techniques for defining customer segments

3. Targeting techniques - Channel selection and media purchase strategy for precise targeting

4. Content dev. and delivery - Personalized message tailoring and delivery mechanism

5. Testing and feedback mechanisms - Media effectiveness and testing procedures for optimizing marketing activities

Activators

Nascent
- Only in-house data employed
- Basic targeting based on demographic segmentation
- Dynamic media buying but static content across channels

Emerging
- Leverages inhouse and social media data
- Advanced targeting based on behavior/micro segmentation
- Dynamic media buying with partially customized content and delivery mechanism

Progressive
- Leverages in-house, social media and 3rd party data
- Dynamic personalization using AI/ML on consumer attributes
- Programmatic media buying with synchronized omni-channel outreach basis customer profile and current context

Pioneer
- Leverages in-house, social media and 3rd party data
- Dynamic personalization using AI/ML on consumer attributes
- Programmatic media buying with synchronized omni-channel outreach basis customer profile and current context
Engagement and Loyalty
Boosting customer retention and aspiration through well-designed loyalty programs

Activators

1. **Simple** - Seamless onboarding process for loyalty program
2. **Functionalities** - Platform feature depth with dynamic reward accretion
3. **Flexible** - Flexibility in earn/burn across partner member network
4. **Differentiated engagement** - Customer tierization with personalized rewards
5. **Experiential** - Integration of gamification elements into loyalty strategy

Emerging

- Quick multi-channel enrolment process with slightly delayed account activation
- Coalition partner led earn and burn flexibility
- Multi-tier aspirational program with basic gamification elements

Progressive

- Near optimum multi-channel enrolment with real-time activation
- Feature rich loyalty platform with rewards also driven by customer behavioral events and social interactions
- Deeply personalized features and rewards across tiers with gamification as core strategy

Pioneer

- Multi-channel enrolment with real-time activation
- Feature rich loyalty platform with rewards also driven by customer behavioral events and social interactions
- Coalitions and partnerships
- Personalized rewards across tiers with gamification as core strategy
**Commerce**

Enabling a seamless cross-channel purchase journey through an enhanced commerce stack

### Activators

1. **Multi-channel selling** - Presence and degree of integration across multiple sales channels

2. **Frictionless purchase process** - Seamless customer payment journey

3. **Functionalities** - Feature richness & depth of commerce platform across channels

4. **Customer feedback** - Service channels, response time & feedback incorporation

### Stages

- **Nascent**
  - Standalone channels with limited integration
  - Tedious payment process with limited payment methods
  - No/minimal CS support

- **Progressive**
  - Frictionless movement across channels with data sync
  - Optimized payment journey eliminating redundant steps with multiple payment options
  - Streamlined CS process with regulated TAT

- **Emerging**
  - Partial integration across channels through re-directs
  - Partially optimized payment journey with better breadth of payment options
  - CS support, but irregular TAT

- **Pioneer**
  - Seamless omni-channel customer journey
  - One click checkout process with a plethora of payment options and partnerships
  - Real time CS chat bots
Personalization and Analytics
Delivering the right experience to the right customer at the right time

Activators

1. **Use cases** - Degree of personalization across different customer touchpoints
2. **Capabilities** - Sophistication of underlying personalization engines
3. **Test/Iterate** - Mechanisms for measurement and optimizing efficacy of algorithms
4. **Dynamic treatment** - Ability to determine engagement opportunities in real-time
5. **Micro segment size** - Degree of hyper-personalization achieved
6. **Event based trigger** - Trigger mechanisms for delivering personalized content
7. **Level of automation** - Level of automation across different process involved in personalization

Nascent
- Manually driven data analytics for personalization with limited iterative optimization
- One-size-fits-all mindset with limited offer differentiation

Emerging
- Rules-based targeting and offer logic with low frequency optimization activities
- Personalization based on large, static cust. segments; Limited automation built into delivery systems

Progressive
- Statistical model-based analytics for offers and comms. with regular testing
- Partially automated message and offer customization across small customer segments

Pioneer
- Deep learning and AI based analytics for personalization with high frequency efficacy testing and improvement
- Dynamic comm. and offers across micro segments (n=1) using integrated CRM tools
Data and BI
Capturing and analyzing relevant customer data to unearth customer engagement opportunities

Activators

1. **Multi source data feeds** - Internal and external data used for gathering customer insights
2. **MIS report** - MIS functionalities and frequency of usage in key business decisions
3. **Data lake/warehouse** - Storage architecture for different data formats
4. **Single 360 view** - Availability and ease of use of holistic customer data view
5. **Event capture/trigger** - Integration frequency of multiple data feeds
6. **Self service analytics** - Organizational delivery mechanism of data analysis and reports

Nascent
- Fragmented data storage
- Need-based data integration
- Disparate dashboards/MIS

Emerging
- Structured data fragmented across multiple locations
- Periodic data integration
- Consolidated, but manually populated dashboards

Progressive
- Cross channel single customer view available but difficult to understand/use
- Data integration done daily
- Automated dashboards and MIS employed in decision making

Pioneer
- Nuanced single customer view across channels with intuitive interface
- Real-time data integration
- Modular, feature rich dashboards (drag and drop) for data-led business decisions
Tech Stack
Robust underlying technology for supporting advanced digital engagement initiatives

Activators

1. Open architecture - Architecture of tech stack driving capabilities such as flexibility, scalability etc.

2. Automation tools - Degree of automation built into tech stack

3. Customization - Adoption of technology customized for nuanced business requirements

4. Security - Data management practices and security measures in places

Nascent
- No process to onboard 3rd party data
- High lead time (6+ months) for scaling or adding new functionalities
- Tech stack with no automation and data security measures in place

Emerging
- Manual process to onboard 3rd party data
- 3-6 months lead time for scaling or adding new functionalities
- Tech stack with low automation capabilities and basic data security measures

Progressive
- Partially automated process for 3rd party data
- 2-3 weeks lead time for scaling or adding new functionalities
- Partial automation capabilities built into stack with basic data security measures

Pioneer
- Fully automated API based process for 3rd party data
- Agile lead time for scaling or adding new functionalities
- Tech stack with high automation and data security treated as a business enabler
**Ways of working**
Organizational practices determining overall engagement strategy and successful implementation

1. **Org structure** - Distribution of key talent across functions
2. **Cross-functional** - Level of collaboration across different org. units
3. **Agile and flexible** - Degree of adoption of agile practices
4. **Training and certification** - Upskilling programs and practices in place
5. **Governance and control** - Involvement of leadership in key business decisions
6. **Turnaround Time** - Average time required for launching key initiatives
7. **Data in decision-making** - Degree of data usage in aiding business decisions

**Activators**

- **Nascent**
  - No dedicated analytics team
  - Single department run program with limited KPIs
  - No upskilling programs for working team

- **Emerging**
  - Shared org level analytics
  - Limited collaboration across certain functions for implementing programs; KPIs not linked to incentives
  - Limited upskilling programs in place

- **Progressive**
  - Dedicated analytics team
  - Partial adoption of agile practices with KPIs linked incentives which are not rigorously monitored
  - Upskilling and training programs in place for certain skills/functions

- **Pioneer**
  - Dedicated highly skilled analytics team
  - Agile with cross functional teams and closely monitored KPIs
  - Upskilling and training programs across the organization